

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK**

In re Terrorist Attacks on September 11, 2001	03 MDL 1570 (GBD)(SN) ECF Case
---	-----------------------------------

This document relates to:

*Jessica DeRubbio et al. v. Islamic Republic of Iran, No. 1:18-cv-05306 (GBD) (SN)*

**[PROPOSED] PARTIAL FINAL JUDGMENT**

Upon consideration of the evidence and arguments submitted by Plaintiffs identified in Exhibit A to this Order, who are each a spouse, parent, child, or sibling (or the estate of a spouse, parent, child, or sibling) of a victim killed in the terrorist attacks on September 11, 2001, and the Judgment by Default for liability only against the Islamic Republic of Iran, ("Iran") entered on May 28, 2019 (03-md-1570, ECF No. 4563), together with the entire record in this case, it is hereby;

ORDERED that partial final judgment is entered against Iran and on behalf of those Plaintiffs who are identified in the attached Exhibit A, who are each a spouse, parent, child, or sibling (or the estate of a spouse, parent, child, or sibling) of individuals killed in the terrorist attacks on September 11, 2001, as indicated in Exhibit A; and it is

ORDERED that Plaintiffs identified in Exhibit A are awarded solatium damages of \$12,500,000 per spouse, \$8,500,000 per parent, \$8,500,000 per child, and \$4,250,000 per sibling, as set forth in Exhibit A; and it is

ORDERED that Plaintiffs identified in Exhibit A are awarded prejudgment interest of 4.96 percent per annum, compounded annually, running from September 11, 2001 until the date of judgment; and it is

ORDERED that Plaintiffs identified in Exhibit A may submit an application for punitive damages, economic damages, or other damages (to the extent such awards have not previously been ordered) at a later date consistent with any future rulings made by this Court on this issue; and it is

ORDERED that the remaining Plaintiffs in *Jessica DeRubbio, et al. v. Islamic Republic of Iran, No. 1:18-cv-05306 (GBD) (SN)* not appearing on Exhibit A, may submit in later stages applications for damages awards, and to the extent such plaintiffs are similarly situated to those appearing on Exhibit A, the applications will be approved consistent with those approved herein for the Plaintiffs appearing on Exhibit A.

Dated: New York, New York  
AUG 19 2019

SO ORDERED:



GEORGE B. DANIELS  
UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE

# EXHIBIT A

**EX. A to DeRubbio Motion for Judgment on Damages***(Alphabetically by Last Name of 9/11 Decedent)*

	NAME OF PLAINTIFF	NAME OF 9/11 DECEDENT	Plaintiff's Relationship to 9/11 Decedent	Solatium Damages
1	Anthony J. DeRubbio	David P. DeRubbio	Sibling	\$4,250,000.00
2	Dominick A. DeRubbio	David P. DeRubbio	Sibling	\$4,250,000.00
3	Jessica DeRubbio	David P. DeRubbio	Child	\$8,500,000.00
4	Anthony Desperito	Andrew Desperito	Child	\$8,500,000.00
5	David Desperito	Andrew Desperito	Child	\$8,500,000.00
6	Laura Desperito-Filiberto	Andrew Desperito	Spouse	\$12,500,000.00
7	Casey Devlin	Dennis L. Devlin	Child	\$8,500,000.00
8	Dennis Devlin	Dennis L. Devlin	Child	\$8,500,000.00
9	Kathleen A. Devlin	Dennis L. Devlin	Spouse	\$12,500,000.00
10	Kathleen E. Devlin	Dennis L. Devlin	Child	\$8,500,000.00
11	Kerry Sharkey	Dennis L. Devlin	Child	\$8,500,000.00
12	Samia Doany	Ramzi A. Doany	Parent	\$8,500,000.00
13	Dina Doany-Azzam	Ramzi A. Doany	Sibling	\$4,250,000.00
14	Chang Don Kim	Lawrence Don Kim	Parent	\$8,500,000.00
15	Catherine Fleming	Lawrence Don Kim	Sibling	\$4,250,000.00
16	April Horton	Edward T. Earhart	Sibling	\$4,250,000.00
17	Andrea Stauter	Edward T. Earhart	Sibling	\$4,250,000.00
18	John Churchill as Personal Representative of the Estate of Lois Churchill	John E. Eichler	Sibling (Deceased)	\$4,250,000.00
19	John R. Eichler	John E. Eichler	Child	\$8,500,000.00
20	Itauma Ette	Sadie Ette	Sibling	\$4,250,000.00
21	Jane M. Cristiano	Thomas Farino	Child	\$8,500,000.00
22	Daniel Farino	Thomas Farino	Sibling	\$4,250,000.00
23	Frank Farino	Thomas Farino	Sibling	\$4,250,000.00
24	James Farino	Thomas Farino	Child	\$8,500,000.00
25	Patrick Farino	Thomas Farino	Sibling	\$4,250,000.00
26	Mary A. Farino-Thomas	Thomas Farino	Spouse	\$12,500,000.00
27	Kathryn Nesbit	Elizabeth A. Farmer	Child	\$8,500,000.00
28	Jennifer Artola	Francis J. Feely	Child	\$8,500,000.00
29	Caitlin Feely	Francis J. Feely	Child	\$8,500,000.00
30	Lori Feely	Francis J. Feely	Spouse	\$12,500,000.00
31	Patricia Feely	Francis J. Feely	Parent	\$8,500,000.00
32	Stephanie Feely	Francis J. Feely	Child	\$8,500,000.00
33	Lauren Ludvigsen	Francis J. Feely	Child	\$8,500,000.00
34	Catherine Curley	Sean B. Fegan	Sibling	\$4,250,000.00
35	Peter Fegan Jr.	Sean B. Fegan	Sibling	\$4,250,000.00
36	Peter Fegan	Sean B. Fegan	Parent	\$8,500,000.00
37	Anne Marie Hartney	Sean B. Fegan	Sibling	\$4,250,000.00

**EX. A to DeRubbio Motion for Judgment on Damages***(Alphabetically by Last Name of 9/11 Decedent)*

	NAME OF PLAINTIFF	NAME OF 9/11 DECEDENT	Plaintiff's Relationship to 9/11 Decedent	Solatium Damages
38	Angela Fields	Samuel Fields Sr.	Spouse	\$12,500,000.00
39	Demetrius Fields	Samuel Fields Sr.	Child	\$8,500,000.00
40	Samuel Fields Jr.	Samuel Fields Sr.	Child	\$8,500,000.00
41	Stefan Fields	Samuel Fields Sr.	Child	\$8,500,000.00
42	Angela Fields as Natural Guardian of SF	Samuel Fields Sr.	Child (Minor)	\$8,500,000.00
43	Sharaia Fields	Samuel Fields Sr.	Child	\$8,500,000.00
44	Brittany Fogel	Stephen M. Fogel	Child	\$8,500,000.00
45	David Fogel	Stephen M. Fogel	Sibling	\$4,250,000.00
46	Joseph Fogel	Stephen M. Fogel	Child	\$8,500,000.00
47	Karen Hamorsky	Stephen M. Fogel	Sibling	\$4,250,000.00
48	Laurie Pater	Stephen M. Fogel	Spouse	\$12,500,000.00
49	David Foreman	Donald A. Foreman	Sibling	\$4,250,000.00
50	Marcus Foreman	Donald A. Foreman	Child	\$8,500,000.00
51	Shirley Foreman	Donald A. Foreman	Parent	\$8,500,000.00
52	Raymond Durant	Virgin (Lucy) Francis	Child	\$8,500,000.00
53	Joseph Francis	Virgin (Lucy) Francis	Child	\$8,500,000.00
54	Peter Francis	Virgin (Lucy) Francis	Child	\$8,500,000.00
55	Troy Francis	Virgin (Lucy) Francis	Child	\$8,500,000.00
56	Felicia Cappel	Gary J. Frank	Sibling	\$4,250,000.00
57	Ellen Vigeant	Gary J. Frank	Parent	\$8,500,000.00
58	Laurie Vigeant	Gary J. Frank	Sibling	\$4,250,000.00
59	Allen Freeman	Tamitha Freeman	Parent	\$8,500,000.00
60	Carla Freeman	Tamitha Freeman	Sibling	\$4,250,000.00
61	Juanita Freeman	Tamitha Freeman	Parent	\$8,500,000.00
62	Xavier White	Tamitha Freeman	Child	\$8,500,000.00
63	Michael Freiman	Brett O. Freiman	Sibling	\$4,250,000.00
64	Bonnie Freiman a/k/a Bonnie Freiman-Magnes	Brett O. Freiman	Parent	\$8,500,000.00
65	Pamela Freiman Rentzer a/k/a Pamela Freiman	Brett O. Freiman	Sibling	\$4,250,000.00
66	Burt A. Lewis as Personal Representative of the Estate of Herbert Freiman	Brett O. Freiman	Parent (Deceased)	\$8,500,000.00
67	Audrey Ades	Paul Friedman	Spouse	\$12,500,000.00
68	Audrey Ades, as Natural Guardian of RHSFF	Paul Friedman	Child (Minor)	\$8,500,000.00
69	Daniel Frost	Lisa Frost	Sibling	\$4,250,000.00
70	Suzanne G. Adams	Anthony E. Gallagher	Sibling	\$4,250,000.00
71	Carolyn Belford	Anthony E. Gallagher	Sibling	\$4,250,000.00
72	Rose Costello	Anthony E. Gallagher	Parent	\$8,500,000.00
73	Joseph Gallagher	Anthony E. Gallagher	Sibling	\$4,250,000.00
74	Carol Varland	Julie M. Geis	Sibling	\$4,250,000.00
75	Michael Geis	Julie M. Geis	Sibling	\$4,250,000.00



**EX. A to DeRubbio Motion for Judgment on Damages***(Alphabetically by Last Name of 9/11 Decedent)*

	NAME OF PLAINTIFF	NAME OF 9/11 DECEDENT	Plaintiff's Relationship to 9/11 Decedent	Solatium Damages
76	Janet Baronian	Edward F. Geraghty	Sibling	\$4,250,000.00
77	Lynn Cannata	Edward F. Geraghty	Sibling	\$4,250,000.00
78	Colin Geraghty	Edward F. Geraghty	Child	\$8,500,000.00
79	Colleen Geraghty	Edward F. Geraghty	Sibling	\$4,250,000.00
80	Connor Geraghty	Edward F. Geraghty	Child	\$8,500,000.00
81	James Geraghty	Edward F. Geraghty	Child	\$8,500,000.00
82	Mary Geraghty	Edward F. Geraghty	Spouse	\$12,500,000.00
83	Maureen Geraghty	Edward F. Geraghty	Sibling	\$4,250,000.00
84	Norma Geraghty	Edward F. Geraghty	Parent	\$8,500,000.00
85	Stephen Geraghty	Edward F. Geraghty	Sibling	\$4,250,000.00
86	Debra Giordano	Jeffrey J. Giordano	Sibling	\$4,250,000.00
87	Annete Herman	Michelle H. Goldstein	Sibling	\$4,250,000.00
88	Ingrid Jaffe	Michelle H. Goldstein	Parent	\$8,500,000.00
89	Rafael Herman	Michelle H. Goldstein	Parent	\$8,500,000.00
90	Tatiana S. Gomez	Wilder A. Gomez	Child	\$8,500,000.00
91	Corina Murillo	Mauricio Gonzalez	Parent	\$8,500,000.00
92	Carly Gordenstein	Lisa F. Gordenstein	Child	\$8,500,000.00
93	David Gordenstein	Lisa F. Gordenstein	Spouse	\$12,500,000.00
94	Samantha Gordenstein	Lisa F. Gordenstein	Child	\$8,500,000.00
95	Dorothy Fenn Grodberg	Lisa F. Gordenstein	Parent	\$8,500,000.00
96	Deborah Fenn	Lisa F. Gordenstein	Sibling	\$4,250,000.00
97	Erika Lutzner	Jon R. Grabowski	Spouse	\$12,500,000.00
98	Kathleen Granados	Gilbert Granados	Child	\$8,500,000.00
99	Maureen Granados	Gilbert Granados	Child	\$8,500,000.00
100	Teresa Granados	Gilbert Granados	Spouse	\$12,500,000.00
101	Lawrence Gray	Tara McCloud Gray	Spouse	\$12,500,000.00
102	Matthew Green	Andrew Peter Charles Curry Green	Sibling	\$4,250,000.00
103	Melrose Morrison Green	Derrick A. Green	Spouse	\$12,500,000.00
104	Delroy Llewellyn	Derrick A. Green	Sibling	\$4,250,000.00
105	Jennifer Green	Wanda Green	Child	\$8,500,000.00
106	Joe Green	Wanda Green	Child	\$8,500,000.00
107	Sandra Jamerson	Wanda Green	Sibling	\$4,250,000.00
108	Aserene Smith	Wanda Green	Parent	\$8,500,000.00
109	Tommy Smith	Wanda Green	Sibling	\$4,250,000.00
110	Evelyn Griffin	John M. Griffin	Parent	\$8,500,000.00
111	John Griffin	John M. Griffin	Parent	\$8,500,000.00
112	Julie Griffin	John M. Griffin	Child	\$8,500,000.00
113	June Griffin	John M. Griffin	Spouse	\$12,500,000.00
114	Jenna Griffin	John M. Griffin	Child	\$8,500,000.00

**EX. A to DeRubbio Motion for Judgment on Damages***(Alphabetically by Last Name of 9/11 Decedent)*

	<b>NAME OF PLAINTIFF</b>	<b>NAME OF 9/11 DECEDENT</b>	<b>Plaintiff's Relationship to 9/11 Decedent</b>	<b>Solatium Damages</b>
115	Lisa Grouzalis	Kenneth Grouzalis	Child	\$8,500,000.00
116	Myrta Gschaar	Robert Gschaar	Spouse	\$12,500,000.00
117	Genevieve Gyulavary	Peter Gyulavary	Child	\$8,500,000.00
118	Jane Gyulavary	Peter Gyulavary	Spouse	\$12,500,000.00
119	Bebe Hafiz	Nezam Hafiz	Parent	\$8,500,000.00
120	Sharon Hafiz	Nezam Hafiz	Sibling	\$4,250,000.00
121	Deborah Khublall	Nezam Hafiz	Sibling	\$4,250,000.00
122	Alisha Halmon	Carolyn Halmon	Child	\$8,500,000.00
123	Herman Halmon	Carolyn Halmon	Spouse	\$12,500,000.00
124	Standish Halmon	Carolyn Halmon	Child	\$8,500,000.00
125	Talat Hamdani	Mohammad S. Hamdani	Parent	\$8,500,000.00
126	Zeshan Hamdani	Mohammad S. Hamdani	Sibling	\$4,250,000.00
127	Beverly Harrington	Melissa M. Harrington-Hughes	Parent	\$8,500,000.00
128	Robert J. Harrington	Melissa M. Harrington-Hughes	Parent	\$8,500,000.00
129	Dawn H. Carbone	Thomas Haskell	Sibling	\$4,250,000.00
130	Kevin Haskell	Thomas Haskell	Sibling	\$4,250,000.00
131	Dawn H. Carbone	Timothy Haskell	Sibling	\$4,250,000.00
132	Kevin Haskell	Timothy Haskell	Sibling	\$4,250,000.00
133	Melissa J. Bernstein	Roberta B. Heber	Child	\$8,500,000.00
134	Stuart Bernstein	Roberta B. Heber	Child	\$8,500,000.00
135	Robyn Bernstein Donati	Roberta B. Heber	Child	\$8,500,000.00
136	Jacob Heber	Roberta B. Heber	Spouse	\$12,500,000.00
137	Robert B. Hemenway Jr.	Ronald J. Hemenway	Sibling	\$4,250,000.00
138	Pamela Dixon	DaJuan Hodges	Parent	\$8,500,000.00
139	Sherard Dixon	DaJuan Hodges	Sibling	\$4,250,000.00
140	Jatair Persol	DaJuan Hodges	Child	\$8,500,000.00
141	David Cannella	Judith Hofmiller	Child	\$8,500,000.00
142	Robert Hofmiller	Judith Hofmiller	Sibling	\$4,250,000.00
143	Francis X. Houston	Charles J. Houston	Sibling	\$4,250,000.00
144	Joan M. Houston	Charles J. Houston	Sibling	\$4,250,000.00
145	Linda Houston	Charles J. Houston	Spouse	\$12,500,000.00
146	Brian Howley	Jennifer L. Howley	Spouse	\$12,500,000.00
147	Gerald Hrycak	Marian R. Hrycak	Sibling	\$4,250,000.00
148	Joanne Hrycak	Marian R. Hrycak	Spouse	\$12,500,000.00
149	Christine Buividas	Marian R. Hrycak	Child	\$8,500,000.00
150	Harold Singleton	Lamar D. Hulse	Sibling	\$4,250,000.00
151	Linda Hulse	Lamar D. Hulse	Parent	\$8,500,000.00
152	Patricia Catherine Hardy	Stephen N. Hyland	Sibling	\$4,250,000.00
153	Charles Hyland	Stephen N. Hyland	Sibling	\$4,250,000.00

**EX. A to DeRubbio Motion for Judgment on Damages***(Alphabetically by Last Name of 9/11 Decedent)*

	NAME OF PLAINTIFF	NAME OF 9/11 DECEDENT	Plaintiff's Relationship to 9/11 Decedent	Solatium Damages
154	Stephen Hyland	Stephen N. Hyland	Parent	\$8,500,000.00
155	Susan Hyland	Stephen N. Hyland	Spouse	\$12,500,000.00
156	Rachel James	Ernest James	Sibling	\$4,250,000.00
157	Michael James Beckford	Gricelda E. James	Spouse	\$12,500,000.00
158	Michael Zinkofsky	Maxima Jean-Pierre	Spouse	\$12,500,000.00
159	Zamani Davis	Charles G. John	Sibling	\$4,250,000.00
160	Veronica John	Charles G. John	Parent	\$8,500,000.00
161	Royston Roach	Charles G. John	Sibling	\$4,250,000.00
162	Charlene Cumberbatch	Charles G. John	Sibling	\$4,250,000.00
163	Gary Jones	Brian L. Jones	Sibling	\$4,250,000.00
164	Leander Jones	Brian L. Jones	Parent	\$8,500,000.00
165	Patricia Jones	Brian L. Jones	Parent	\$8,500,000.00
166	Teri Marshall	Brian L. Jones	Sibling	\$4,250,000.00
167	June Jurgens	Paul W. Jurgens	Child	\$8,500,000.00
168	Lindsay Jurgens	Paul W. Jurgens	Child	\$8,500,000.00
169	Maria Jurgens	Paul W. Jurgens	Spouse	\$12,500,000.00
170	Paul Jurgens	Paul W. Jurgens	Child	\$8,500,000.00
171	Jeanne Keating	Paul Hanlon Keating	Sibling	\$4,250,000.00
	<b>Total</b>			<b>\$1,285,750,000.00</b>